

Gifted English 10

Unit 1: At War with Ourselves and Others

War Poetry Comparison-Contrast Essay Rubric

Standard	Exceeding	Meeting	Nearing	Missing
<p>Understanding of Theme and Use of Evidence ELACC9-10RL2: Determine a theme of text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text. ELACC9-10RL1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inference drawn from the text.</p>	<p>(40 points) Essay effectively compares and contrasts themes of two poems. Convincingly analyzes development of main ideas and persuasively cites and explains at least four quotations from each poem as evidence.</p>	<p>(30 points) Essay competently compares and contrasts themes of two poems. Reasonably analyzes development of main ideas and proficiently cites and explains at least three quotations from each poem as evidence.</p>	<p>(20 points) Essay attempts to compare and contrast themes of two poems and to develop main ideas but is inadequate. Essay attempts to provide evidence, citing two quotations from each poem as evidence but not explaining effectively.</p>	<p>(10 points) Essay fails to adequately compare and contrasts themes of two poems. Reveals lack of understanding main ideas. Essay provides minimal support from the text with only one quotation from each poem as evidence.</p>
<p>Knowledge of Language ELACC9-10RL4: Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone. ELACC9-10L6: Use accurately domain-specific vocabulary sufficient for reading and writing at the college level.</p>	<p>(30 points) Essay compellingly uses precise literary terminology to convey interpretation and effectively analyze poets' use of diction and figurative language to establish tone. At least 6 vocabulary words are used correctly.</p>	<p>(22 points) Essay competently identifies literary devices in analysis and determines how diction and figurative language relate to tone. Correctly uses 4 vocabulary words.</p>	<p>(15 points) Use of literary terminology lacks precision or accuracy. Essay attempts to explain meaning of diction and figurative language but is misguided or inadequate. Correctly uses 2 vocabulary words.</p>	<p>(8 points) Essay fails to incorporate accurate literary terminology and misreads diction and figurative language. Correctly uses fewer than 2 vocabulary words.</p>
<p>Development of Ideas ELACC9-10W2: Write explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content. ELACC9-10W4: Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.</p>	<p>(20 points) Essay and ideas are well-developed. Ideas are logically organized and grouped together effectively, incorporating a compelling introduction, strong thesis, and unified paragraphs that are precisely focused.</p>	<p>(15 points) Essay and ideas are sufficiently developed. Ideas are organized, establishing a competent introduction, clear thesis, and paragraphs that are generally focused.</p>	<p>(10 points) Development of essay and ideas may be lacking, conveying an organization that is confusing or unclear. Introduction is underdeveloped, thesis is imprecise, and paragraphs are not developed or unified.</p>	<p>(5 points) Development of essay and ideas is unorganized and confusing. Thesis is missing, and paragraphing is ignored.</p>
<p>Application of Conventions ELACC9-10L1 & L2: Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing or speaking.</p>	<p>(10 points) Spelling, punctuation, and capitalization are accurate. Sentence structure is varied; sentence types advance ideas and are apt for the analytical purpose.</p>	<p>(8 points) Few errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Sentence structure is somewhat varied and aids analytical purpose.</p>	<p>(5 points) Several errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Varied sentence structure is attempted but tends towards repetition.</p>	<p>(2 points) Errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization distract from interpretation or make analysis incomprehensible. Sentence types are repetitive and unvaried.</p>

37

30

20

8

Total 95 /100

Comments: Your central contrast is compelling, but make sure that you explain how each piece of EV supports your point. Your discussion of tone is compelling and use of vocabulary vivid and precise.

The concept of death has sparked ...

D? Hook?

91? → Death is an interesting concept. It has sparked wonder, fear, and greatness in ~~the~~ man. During the World War I era death was a common thing? War had broken out both in foreign soils of Europe but also at the heart of the United States. A poem written by Wilfred Owen during WWI

Hook?
The poem
thinks?

thought it not great to die for ones country - that death was a terribly meddling experience. However back in the USA at the same time, race was were breaking out. Claude McKay thought it to be a prestigious event to die for ones belief, to be a martyr. The emotional effect of death versus pride in a belief are two strong emotions. McKay's poem, "If We Must Die," embraces death for a belief and arouses a fighting spirit, while "Dulce et Decorum Est" by Wilfred Owen establishes death as the epitome of sorrow.

Clear
contrast
established
in thesis

One for
files

Dig deeper
with meaning

*You

Tone weighs heavily on the feel of these two poems. Owen uses words like "desperate," "haunting," and "obscure" to create a tone that makes even the strong men weep. This tone in combination with death makes ^{sure} what Owen is trying to say hits deep in our hearts. In contrast McKay thought it better to stand, fight, and die rather than avoid death. However the line "If we must die, let us nobly die" makes death seem imminent and so it would only be right to stand and die. central device?

Specific
was to
describe
tone?

Imagery is Owen's strong point here. His expert appeal to ^{almost} all of the senses elicites the reader making every line an experience. Possibly one of the best examples is this, "before my helpless sight, he plunges at me, gattering, choking, drowning." This sentence shows how the death of another fellow man is something almost abominable. McKay lacks in imagery. But for what is missing here

Describe
how the
imagery

creates
feeling

quote

is made up in his language. Phrases such as "dying, but fighting back!" elicit such a strong sense of pride and courage that imagery would seem almost melodramatic. McKay also utilizes metaphors to his advantage. He alienates those men that attack him by calling them "mad and hungry dogs." This, in conjunction with the simile of him and his comrades, makes the dogs seem as such while they are still "like" boys.

Insightful
point - but
state it
more
clearly.

adj to describe?

★
clear
analysis
→ response

Both of these poems command emotion from the reader. Owen uses imagery and tone to create a sense of disdain for the very thing. McKay writes with his strong ethical tone and use of metaphors. Both cope with death in battle two different ways. When looking at these two poems in conjunction they compose a paradox that makes you question what Owen calls "the old lie". Is it really a sweet and honorable thing to die for ones country to be a martyr for what you believe in? Or is death really a tragic and terrible event.

EX3

Simply

You need to discuss this aspect of the poem.

37

30

20

8

use of vocabulary vivid and precise.

Gifted English 10

Unit 1: At War with Ourselves and Others

War Poetry Comparison-Contrast Essay Rubric

Standard	Exceeding	Meeting	Nearing	Missing
<p>Understanding of Theme and Use of Evidence ELACC9-10RL2: Determine a theme of text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text. ELACC9-10RL1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inference drawn from the text.</p>	<p>(40 points) Essay effectively compares and contrasts themes of two poems. Convincingly analyzes development of main ideas and persuasively cites and explains at least four quotations from each poem as evidence.</p>	<p>(30 points) Essay competently compares and contrasts themes of two poems. Reasonably analyzes development of main ideas and proficiently cites and explains at least three quotations from each poem as evidence.</p>	<p>(20 points) Essay attempts to compare and contrast themes of two poems and to develop main ideas but is inadequate. Essay attempts to provide evidence, citing two quotations from each poem as evidence but not explaining effectively.</p>	<p>(10 points) Essay fails to adequately compare and contrasts themes of two poems. Reveals lack of understanding main ideas. Essay provides minimal support from the text with only one quotation from each poem as evidence.</p>
<p>Knowledge of Language ELACC9-10RL4: Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone. ELACC9-10L6: Use accurately domain-specific vocabulary sufficient for reading and writing at the college level.</p>	<p>(30 points) Essay compellingly uses precise literary terminology to convey interpretation and effectively analyze poets' use of diction and figurative language to establish tone. At least 6 vocabulary words are used correctly.</p>	<p>(22 points) Essay competently identifies literary devices in analysis and determines how diction and figurative language relate to tone. Correctly uses 4 vocabulary words.</p>	<p>(15 points) Use of literary terminology lacks precision or accuracy. Essay attempts to explain meaning of diction and figurative language but is misguided or inadequate. Correctly uses 2 vocabulary words.</p>	<p>(8 points) Essay fails to incorporate accurate literary terminology and misreads diction and figurative language. Correctly uses fewer than 2 vocabulary words.</p>
<p>Development of Ideas ELACC9-10W2: Write explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content. ELACC9-10W4: Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.</p>	<p>(20 points) Essay and ideas are well-developed. Ideas are logically organized and grouped together effectively, incorporating a compelling introduction, strong thesis, and unified paragraphs that are precisely focused.</p>	<p>(15 points) Essay and ideas are sufficiently developed. Ideas are organized, establishing a competent introduction, clear thesis, and paragraphs that are generally focused.</p>	<p>(10 points) Development of essay and ideas may be lacking, conveying an organization that is confusing or unclear. Introduction is underdeveloped, thesis is imprecise, and paragraphs are not developed or unified.</p>	<p>(5 points) Development of essay and ideas is unorganized and confusing. Thesis is missing, and paragraphing is ignored.</p>
<p>Application of Conventions ELACC9-10L1 & L2: Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing or speaking.</p>	<p>(10 points) Spelling, punctuation, and capitalization are accurate. Sentence structure is varied; sentence types advance ideas and are apt for the analytical purpose.</p>	<p>(8 points) Few errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Sentence structure is somewhat varied and aids analytical purpose.</p>	<p>(5 points) Several errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Varied sentence structure is attempted but tends towards repetition.</p>	<p>(2 points) Errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization distract from interpretation or make analysis incomprehensible. Sentence types are repetitive and unvaried.</p>

40

26

15

8

Total 89 /100

Comments: Your central idea is strong and you effectively analyze tone. What you need to concentrate on in your revision is organization. Your ideas in body are not grouped in the clearest way.

War, what is it good for
* allusion in your title

9-14-12

The year is 1917, it's the middle of World War I, and 25 year old Wilfred Owen is writing. His two most famous poems - "Dulce Et Decorum Est" and "Anthem for Doomed Youth" both focus on the more vulgar side of war. They both seem to go along the lines of what the talented Edwin Starr once sang "War, what is it good for?" Both poems use imagery and other devices, to convey their messages, however, one seems agitated about it, while the other is trying to get sympathy, almost in an ironic way. Because of this, these poems compare in their theme as well as their main literary device used, but differ in their tone and other literary devices used.

Would including info that there is a soldier enrich your context?

D? Be precise with word choice.

GEN? people think of war, they think of the honor and glory you'll feel while fighting, and how war is not for the weak or weak at heart. However, in both of his poems, Wilfred Owen thinks exactly the opposite. In "Anthem for Doomed Youth," he wants you to see that kids are fighting this war, and no, they're not given special treatments, they aren't oblivious to the horrors, they are apart of them. When we stop and think about it, war is not a thing to be lauded. In "Dulce Et Decorum Est," he witnesses something

Devices for what purpose? connection to meaning?

Why? Because it's actually been to war?

no 2nd person in your essay

EV? EV? EV?

horrific: "In all my dreams, before my helpless sight, he plunges at me, guttering, choking, drowning." Wilfred Owen is literally watching someone die, die, because they he ^{AGR} had to fight for ~~their~~ ^{his} country. When's he's dead, as "Anthem for Doomed Youth" puts it - "no prayers no bells; nor any voice of mourning..." this meaning they don't even receive a proper funeral, they're left to rot into the earth, the earth they're supposed to be honored about for ~~fighting~~ ^{fighting} for it. With all this said, Wilfred Owen wants ~~to~~ to see that war is not a lovely concept ^{CS} it's despicable, and in both his poems, this rings true.

"Gas, Gas! Quick boys!" this line in "Dulce Et Decorum Est" is part of Wilfred Owen's main literary device - imagery. The ^{quote} ^{D? notation} is his thoughts wanting to tell to someone ^{Refuse!} to warn them a gas bomb exploded, a part of auditory imagery. "no prayers no bells; nor any voice of mourning, see the chow's - the shrill... of wailing shells." Although this is a line from "Anthem of Doomed Youth", the literary device used here is also auditory imagery, in this case the imagery is trying to get ~~you~~ to hear the awful sounds the dead soldiers hear for their funeral, compared to the bereaved ones, a normal person has. The poems both express forms of imagery. While their theme may be the same,

40

26

TS?
 You main idea of a novel to convey to message?
 15 imagery to convey message?
 why choose imagery to convey message?
 8

too superficial

in body the aren't grouped in the clear way.

how the author chooses to ^{D?} say that theme differs. In "Dulce Et Decorum Est" the author states ~~uses the poem with~~ ~~at the~~ ~~very~~ end: "The old lie: Dulce et decorum est pro patria mori." which translates to it's sweet and right to die for one's country. But, notice ~~here before that~~ he calls this statement is said, he writes "the old lie." Obviously, Wilfred Owen has been lied to, so his tone throughout the poem is agitated, even angry. Differing from the tone is the tone of "Anthem for Doomed Youth." "No mockeries now for them... what candles may be held to speed them all?" These quotes reflect a sympathetic tone. Owen wants ~~us~~ feel sympathetic for the youngsters in the war. This also creates an ironic tone because Owen himself is a young duke, ^{D?} and normally we picture an older person wanting you to feel sympathy for the younger, not a young person feeling sympathy for a person their same age. Simply put, Owen's tones are opposite in his poems.

Lastly, "Anthem for Doomed Youth" uses imagery as well as several other devices throughout the poem. He uses consonance we he states: "...stuttering rifle's rapid rattle." We have r sands a tt sands, sands we normally use to imitate guns. He also uses repetition of the word NO and then places it with

keep throughout the poem to highlight the irony

By whom? Think bigger!

D?

REP?

Auth?
EV?

too superficial?

70

40
26
Words normally used to describe a funeral, simply to get you to see that the ~~you~~ dead soldiers do not get anything. On the other hand, in "Dulce Et Decorum Est," Owen only uses imagery. "Bent double, like old beggars, ... Coughing like hags, ... e-e斯塔 of fumbling, ... guttering, choking, drawing," all of these, even though they are different types, are all imagery, and it's the only device used throughout the entire poem.

?
15
8
In conclusion, these poems similarities outweigh their differences. Even though how they speak their message, the messages are the same and they convey the message the same way by using imagery. Also, both poems reveal that we as humans tend to be oblivious of how war really is. We see it as an honorable deed, until we actually become a soldier and have to fight for our country as well as our lives. "War, what is it good for, absolutely nothing." (Edwin Starr).

in body its suit grouped in the crematorium.

Gifted English 10

Unit 1: At War with Ourselves and Others

War Poetry Comparison-Contrast Essay Rubric

Standard	Exceeding	Meeting	Nearing	Missing
<p>Understanding of Theme and Use of Evidence ELACC9-10RL2: Determine a theme of text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text. ELACC9-10RL1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inference drawn from the text.</p>	<p>(40 points) Essay effectively compares and contrasts themes of two poems. Convincingly analyzes development of main ideas and persuasively cites and explains at least four quotations from each poem as evidence.</p>	<p>(30 points) Essay competently compares and contrasts themes of two poems. Reasonably analyzes development of main ideas and proficiently cites and explains at least three quotations from each poem as evidence.</p>	<p>(20 points) Essay attempts to compare and contrast themes of two poems and to develop main ideas but is inadequate. Essay attempts to provide evidence, citing two quotations from each poem as evidence but not explaining effectively.</p>	<p>(10 points) Essay fails to adequately compare and contrasts themes of two poems. Reveals lack of understanding main ideas. Essay provides minimal support from the text with only one quotation from each poem as evidence.</p>
<p>Knowledge of Language ELACC9-10RL4: Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone. ELACC9-10L6: Use accurately domain-specific vocabulary sufficient for reading and writing at the college level.</p>	<p>(30 points) Essay compellingly uses precise literary terminology to convey interpretation and effectively analyze poets' use of diction and figurative language to establish tone. At least 6 vocabulary words are used correctly.</p>	<p>(22 points) Essay competently identifies literary devices in analysis and determines how diction and figurative language relate to tone. Correctly uses 4 vocabulary words.</p>	<p>(15 points) Use of literary terminology lacks precision or accuracy. Essay attempts to explain meaning of diction and figurative language but is misguided or inadequate. Correctly uses 2 vocabulary words.</p>	<p>(8 points) Essay fails to incorporate accurate literary terminology and misreads diction and figurative language. Correctly uses fewer than 2 vocabulary words.</p>
<p>Development of Ideas ELACC9-10W2: Write explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content. ELACC9-10W4: Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.</p>	<p>(20 points) Essay and ideas are well-developed. Ideas are logically organized and grouped together effectively, incorporating a compelling introduction, strong thesis, and unified paragraphs that are precisely focused.</p>	<p>(15 points) Essay and ideas are sufficiently developed. Ideas are organized, establishing a competent introduction, clear thesis, and paragraphs that are generally focused.</p>	<p>(10 points) Development of essay and ideas may be lacking, conveying an organization that is confusing or unclear. Introduction is underdeveloped, thesis is imprecise, and paragraphs are not developed or unified.</p>	<p>(5 points) Development of essay and ideas is unorganized and confusing. Thesis is missing, and paragraphing is ignored.</p>
<p>Application of Conventions ELACC9-10L1 & L2: Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing or speaking.</p>	<p>(10 points) Spelling, punctuation, and capitalization are accurate. Sentence structure is varied; sentence types advance ideas and are apt for the analytical purpose.</p>	<p>(8 points) Few errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Sentence structure is somewhat varied and aids analytical purpose.</p>	<p>(5 points) Several errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Varied sentence structure is attempted but tends towards repetition.</p>	<p>(2 points) Errors in spelling, punctuation, and capitalization distract from interpretation or make analysis incomprehensible. Sentence types are repetitive and unvaried.</p>

30

30

18

5

missing conclusion?

Total 83 /100

Comments: *Work on the # about "They" to discuss its irony and structure. You should include the complex idea about retaliation throughout your essay - rather than only the introduction.*

Compare/contrast essay

*hook - definitely grabs attention

"Oooowwaaah" The sounds of pain flow forsaken and abundant, yet in different poetic styles. In 1910 there was a wave of race riots in American cities, when Jamaican-born writer Claude McKay wrote his sonnet, If We Must Die, to urge his comrades to fight back. A few years earlier in 1917, Siegfried Sasson, a World War I Soldier, wrote a poem called, They, describing his mood after the battle. His poem They, is about how each man has changed physically during the war. Imagery is used to show this through a visualization.

Qm for poem titles

*context

CS
PR?

McKay's Sonnet, If We Must Die, tells his people to not die without a fight, to do it honorably and with valor. he also uses Imagery to show this.

CS

use imagery

Although both of these poems were written to show the agonies of conflict, they are different in the way that one urges retaliation, while the other shows the result of retaliation.

Couldnt I have used REP's in one statement?

Qm?

If We Must Die, by Claude McKay, is written to encourage African American's at the time to not die without fighting back. He uses this imagery, "so that our precious blood may not be shed," to paint a picture of the horrible blood shed that was going on at this

AP

complete the idea of the "in vain"

g

D?

Apostrophe shows possession or contraction - not plural.

time. He also uses ~~it~~ "shall he constrained to honor us though dead," to show how they were honored for opposing the wrath of those attacks.

CS

Ex?
AP
AP

however, they were dead. He compares how they are treated to that of bag's in this simile: "If we must die, let it not be like horses."

imagery

Another technique McKay uses is kinesthetic "And for their thousand blows deal one deathblow." By this he is saying that they have been hit thousands of times, so they must avenged their fallen brothers and sisters by returning one mighty blow that would put an end to everything. The tone throughout the poem is mainly reverence, and only in the last two lines does it change to an horrified tone. This poem is well written and provides a great reason to retaliate.

EV?

30 Don't just replace the qu - be using this metaphors to say about the history of racial mistreatment in America?

This is not a change from reverence.

5 TS? main idea? paren? main AN-less PS.

In 1917 Siegfried Sassoon wrote, "They," a poem about all men being changed after war. Sassoon was a soldier in World War I and this poem describes the injuries of his platoon. Sassoon uses ~~it~~ of imagery like "For George lost both his legs; and Bill's stone blind; and poor Jim's shot through the lungs and

D? RIP

one complex scene a scene. ...

your essay - rather than only the introduction

like to die" to give a visual image of the injuries suffered. Even with these injuries the men were resilient to death. "They will not be the same; for they'll have fought," is kinesthetic because it shows that they have physically fought and changed. Sassoon also alludes to a person who wants to fill the world with wickedness in this quote; "On Anti-Christ, their comrades." The tone in the first stanza is reverence because they are honored for fighting, while the tone of the second stanza is

~~sad~~ and depressed because it talks about the irreparable injuries they sustained. This poem shows that just about everyone who fought in World War I came out physically changed at the least.

The similarities are more prominent between these two poems.

Conclusion?

There is this irony in this poem that you're missing. Why the contrast between the Bishop and Sassoon's views?

EV 7 tone?

D?

How is this relevant to your main idea? *yo' I don't have to leave it out.